

ECG MEMBERSHIP APPLICATION PROCESS AND FORM

The Evaluation Cooperation Group (ECG) was established in 1996 following an assessment of the five major multilateral development banks (MDBs), the report of which called for efforts to harmonize performance indicators and evaluation criteria among the MDBs.

In 2011, ECG members established a formal process for institutions applying for ECG membership. Details of this application process and the forms to be completed are found below.

1. Current structure

1.1. ECG has a **three-tier membership structure** composed of: members, permanent observers¹ and temporary observers.

1.2. Temporary observers are expected to strive to become full members at their convenience, upon agreement of the existing membership. Only full members have ECG voting rights.

1.3. Except for the permanent observers, members and temporary observers represent the Central Evaluation Departments (CEDs) of their respective institutions.

2. Application and admission process to become a Temporary Observer

2.1. New **applicants** may approach the ECG directly through the standing ECG Chair or the ECG Secretariat, or be introduced by an existing member.²

2.2. The **ECG Membership Committee** is a standing committee, elected/re-confirmed tri-annually by member majority vote and normally comprising or representing three members (preferably including one predominantly private sector and one public sector oriented member). Only (full) members are eligible to serve on the Committee.

2.3. Once an (informal or formal) application has been received, it is brought immediately to the attention of the ECG membership, including the Membership Committee. The Committee may conduct a first informal compliance check which, if resulting in a negative assessment for clear-cut non-compliance reasons, is conveyed to the membership. In cases where the membership confirms the Committee's initial assessment, the standing ECG Chair will decline the application in an appropriate form and before a more formal assessment by the Committee is necessary.

2.4. All new applicants for Temporary Observer status must complete the **application form** ([Appendix 1](#)) and the **self assessment form** ([Appendix 2](#)). The completed application and self-assessment forms must be sent to the standing ECG Chair or the ECG Secretariat, who will transmit them to the Membership Committee. Applicants must also nominate at least one ECG member as a sponsor. Concomitantly, the sponsor(s) should send a brief **reference note** to the existing membership, through the ECG Secretariat and for the benefit of the Membership Committee, stating the suitability of and reasons supporting the application.

¹ Permanent observer-ship status is provided on invitation by the ECG and currently applies to the OECD Evaluation Network (<http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation>), the Global Environment Facility (www.thegef.org) and the Chairperson of the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG, www.unevaluation.org).

² For ECG details and respective contacts please refer to www.ecgnet.org.

2.5. Upon receipt of the application form, the self-assessment and the reference note(s), the Membership Committee will undertake an initial compliance assessment (Section 2.3) before entering into a more in-depth assessment in case of positive prospects. Based on the self-assessment form ([Appendix 2](#)), a representative of the Membership Committee will visit the applicant's institution and form an independent opinion. The Membership Committee, upon satisfaction of the applicant's eligibility prospects and commitment to ECG, will prepare a note of recommendation to the ECG for the applicant's admission as **temporary observer and a corresponding item for decision will be included in the following ECG meeting's agenda**. Prior to this, the Membership Committee will inform the candidate of its proposal, giving the candidate itself the option to withdraw before any vote is cast.

2.6. At the following ECG meeting, the candidate will be invited to make a presentation on its application. After the presentation, ECG membership will discuss the Committee's recommendation and, eventually, confirm the applicant's temporary observership by majority vote of the members. During the deliberations and voting, only members and permanent observers will be present (with members only having voting rights). If the application is declined, the ECG Chair, in consultation with all members, will send an explanatory letter to the applicant. If the application is accepted, the standing ECG Chair will invite the representative of the new temporary observer (normally the head of the CED) to attend the next ECG meeting.

3. Temporary Observer to Full Member

3.1. Temporary Observers are expected to strive for full membership at their earliest convenience (usually within two calendar years from the application date). The said graduation period allows both parties to assess whether their respective expectations are being met.

3.2. Towards the end of the graduation period, in consultation with and upon invitation by the Temporary Observer, the Membership Committee will be asked to complete an independent assessment based on criteria set out in [Appendix 3](#). The applicant's attendance at ECG meetings, and participation in and contribution towards ECG activities will be assessed based on ECG meeting minutes and experiences (desk assessment). Progress towards GPS compliance will, however, require another visit by a representative to the graduating institution. The GPS compliance assessment, however, shall not be undertaken with the rigor of related previous benchmarking exercises (i.e. not requiring participation by other ECG members) but in the form of an evidence collection at the institution (mainly at its CED), involving CED-external interviews as determined appropriate. The Membership Committee's assessment on the items in [Appendix 3](#) will be conveyed to the membership together with a recommendation.

3.3. A positive majority vote of ECG membership will automatically award the Temporary Observer and candidate the rank of full Member. The standing ECG Chair will subsequently inform the candidate by an official letter.

3.4. A negative majority vote of ECG total full membership represents the formal rejection of the application. However, if solutions to the lacking criteria are identified, the option to send back the **application** to the Membership Committee for a second review focused on remaining issues may be possible. The applicant will have the option to benefit from extra time to redress its situation or to withdraw the application, without a formal negative vote being cast.

4. Obligations and cessation of Temporary Observers and Members

4.1. Temporary Observers are exempt from membership dues (based on the ECG cost-sharing agreement agreed at the ECG Spring meeting 2014), except for those ECG activities or cost elements to which they commit to contribute.

4.2. Full membership requires:

- Adherence to and promoting of the ECG's Mandate, course and governance procedures;

- Active participation in ECG meetings at highest CED level and support of Group-adopted activities, resolutions, working groups and otherwise decisions; and
- Timely payment of membership dues, normally on a cost-sharing basis but which may be adapted from time-to-time;

4.3. Withdrawal from ECG membership or observership should be made in writing by the head of the CED or acceptable authority level of the institution concerned. The withdrawal letter should be sent to the standing ECG Chair directly or through the ECG Secretariat.

4.4. Termination of ECG membership or observership, apart from in the case of 3.4 above, requires a minimum vote of three quarters of the total full membership, after prior reasonable efforts made by the ECG to resolve the underlying problems or dissents. The case of a non confirmed temporary observership is regulated by point 3.4 above with the majority stated there.

5. Review

5.1. The ECG Membership process is reviewed every three years to verify its effectiveness and efficiency, and allow eventual changes and/or improvements if necessary. ECG members will confirm by majority the adoption of the process and the results of the review.

APPENDIX 1

ECG MEMBERSHIP APPLICATION FORM

Application Submission Date:	
Institution Name and (HQ) Address:	
Name of the Central Evaluation Function:	
Applicant's Name and Business Title:	
Applicant's email:	
Applicant's telephone:	
Motivation for application (<50 words):	
Other Professional Affiliations or Memberships:	
Institution's Core Mandate or Mission (<50 words):	

Note: Please attach the institution's organizational chart to your application.

APPENDIX 2

ECG ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

[FIRST STEP: APPLICATION FOR TEMPORARY OBSERVERSHIP]

The following list of eligibility criteria (“Principles”) serves equally as the applicant’s self-assessment template and the ECG Membership Committee’s independent validation grid.

The procedure for application is:

- **Applicant’s self-assessment:** The applicant self-checks its position against the Principles in order to verify its eligibility;
- **Membership Committee’s validation:** The ECG Membership Committee confirms (or not) the eligibility and makes a recommendation to the membership.

The applicant must comply with the four “Core Principles” and be materially compliant (compliance with at least 66% of the elements for each principle) with the four “Other Principles”, as described in the two following sections.

The **Core Principles** against which the applicant’s eligibility are assessed are:

1. Independence of the applying institution’s Central Evaluation Department (CED)	
Definition:	The applicant must fully comply with the ECG-approved Good Practice Standards (GPS) on the Independence of International Financial Institutions’ CED ³ .
Annotation:	The minimum criterion to be met by the applicant is: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Independence from the prime subject of the CED’s evaluations;• Typically, independence from operation units.
Comment by applicant:	

2. Multilateral Institution Status	
Definition:	The applicant institution must be an international institution with multiple governmental membership.
Annotation:	The applicant’s CED must be separate and distinct from that of other ECG members.
Comment by applicant:	

³ ECGnet/document/ecg-big-book-good-practice-standards

3. Status as a International Financial Institution	
Definition:	A financial institution must provide loans, equity and/or guarantees, or combinations thereof (e.g., quasi-equity) to the public or private sector. They borrow funds to do so.
Annotation:	Guiding criteria for the applicant self-assessment (not exhaustive) include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Main operation thrust of the institution must be financial interventions in shareholder countries (rather than grant provisioning); • Financing of its operations through (or covered by) its share capital or capital market refinancing or re-insuring; • Mandatorily requiring cost- or exposure recovery; • Applying economic principles; and • Aiming at achieving higher-order of political objectives and impacts.
Comment by applicant:	

4. Acceptance of the harmonization mandate set by the MDB Heads in 1996:	
Definition (from ECG mandate):	The ECG (i) works to strengthen cooperation among evaluators and (ii) seeks to harmonize evaluation methodology in its member institutions, thereby combining results among institutions in comparable areas, while taking into account the differing circumstances of each institution. Harmonization in the ECG (...) is not interpreted by members as standardization of evaluation policies and practices.
Annotation:	Even though full harmonization may not be achievable, given diverging mandates, histories and practices among MDBs, the applicant should be <u>committed</u> to strive for optimising ‘harmonization’ in concert with other ECG members.
Comment by applicant:	

Other Principles against which the applicant’s eligibility will be assessed (a material compliance or a minimum of 66% of the elements for each principle should be met versus benchmark values for material compliance) include:

1. Size of the Institution		
Definition:	The applicant is required to fulfil minimum specific elements to qualify as a sizeable institution in term of economic dimension, membership and staff.	
	Element	Benchmark
	Number of shareholders	>25
	Capital (subscribed)	> 2 bn
	Own funds	> 2 bn
	Total borrowing	> 2 bn
	Total administrative budget	>USD 50m
	Total staff	> 200

Comment by applicant:

2. Scope for operations

Definition: The applicant is required to be able to demonstrate a significant yearly activity in terms of number of projects and sectorial and geographical coverage.

Element	Benchmark	Applicant
Sectors covered	>10	
Number of projects per year	>100	
Volume of appr. operations (year)	>USD1bn	
Recipient countries	>20	

Comment by applicant:

3. Sustainability of CED

Definition: The applicant is required to demonstrate the sustainability of its CED by meeting minimum criteria of organization and procedures/ policies.

Element	Benchmark	Applicant
CED total staff	>10	
CED budget vs total administrative budget	>1 m or > 1%	
Separate Evaluation Department	Yes	
Seniority of Head of Department	Min. 2 nd line	
Access to information	Unrestricted	
Effective disclosure policy	Yes	

Comment by applicant:

4. Work Programme

Definition: The applicant is required to prove its capability of producing high level evaluative products and its control on work programme.

Element	Benchmark	Applicant
Percentage of projects possibly subject to evaluation	100%	
CED develops its own work program that may be endorsed by the Board	Yes	
Produces high level evaluation reports	Yes	

Comment by applicant:

APPENDIX 3

ECG ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

[SECOND STEP: TEMPORARY OBSERVER TO BE ADMITTED AS (FULL) MEMBER]

Institution name:	
Temporary Observer since:	
Date of application for full membership:	

1. ECG meeting attendance

Comments by applicant:	
Comments by the Membership Committee:	

2. Active participation in and contribution to ECG Courses and activities

Comments by applicant:	
Comments by the Membership Committee:	

3. To the degree required, progress on pertinent harmonization agendas, notably on relevant Good Practices Standards.

Comments by applicant:	
Comments by the Membership Committee:	